

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY  
CAMDEN VICINAGE**

<b>IN RE: VALSARTAN, LOSARTAN, AND IRBESARTAN PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Case No. 19-md-2875 MDL No. 2875</b>  <b>Honorable Renée Marie Bumb, Chief District Judge</b>  <b>Special Master Judge Thomas Vanaskie</b>
<i>This Document Relates to All Losartan and Irbesartan Actions</i>	

**STIPULATION ON MOTION TO DISMISS AND ORDER**

WHEREAS, Defendants previously moved to dismiss Plaintiffs' Master Valsartan Complaints along with extensive briefing of arguments and authorities in support (*see* ECF 520-523, 598-600);

WHEREAS after consideration of the motions briefing, this Court entered a series of opinions and orders on the motions to dismiss filed by Defendants regarding Plaintiffs' Master Valsartan Complaints (*see* ECF 675-676, 728-729, 775-776, 818-819, 838-839, 1019-1020);

WHEREAS, the Special Master and this Court granted Plaintiffs' motion for leave to amend their Master Valsartan Complaints (*see* ECF 1614-1615, 1994) and allowed certain claims as specified therein, consistent with the Court's prior rulings on Defendants' motions to dismiss;

WHEREAS, prior to the Court's rulings noted above, Plaintiffs at the Court's direction filed Master Complaints for Losartan and Irbesartan, the operative versions of which are on the Court's docket at ECF 681 (Master Losartan Medical Monitoring Complaint), 682 (Master Losartan Personal Injury Complaint), 683 (Master Irbesartan Personal Injury Complaint), 751 (Master First Amended Losartan Economic Loss Complaint), and 752 (Master First Amended Irbesartan Economic Loss Complaint);

WHEREAS, Defendants seek to similarly move to dismiss Plaintiffs' Master Complaints for Losartan and Irbesartan, based on the same or similar grounds, arguments and authorities set forth in Defendants' prior Motions to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Master Valsartan Complaints in a way that resolves the motions, promotes efficiency and preserves Defendants' appellate rights;

WHEREAS, the parties, to conserve their and the Court's resources and for efficiency's sake, seek to avoid briefing motions to dismiss on the Master Losartan and Irbesartan Complaints that would be substantially similar to the prior briefing on the motions to dismiss filed by Defendants as to Plaintiffs' Master Valsartan Complaints, and which would likely generate substantially similar orders and opinions from this Court as to Losartan and Irbesartan;

WHEREAS, the parties seek to preserve all of their respective appellate rights as to each Losartan and Irbesartan claim, defense, motion, ruling, issue and argument;

WHEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:

1. Defendants are hereby deemed to have filed Motions to Dismiss the Master Losartan and Irbesartan Complaints and Amended Complaints asserting, adopting and incorporating any and all positions, arguments and authorities set forth in Defendants' Motions to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Master Valsartan Complaints and the extensive briefing in support (*see* ECF 520-523, 598-600);
2. Claims in the Master Losartan and Irbesartan Complaints that are substantially similar or identical to claims that were previously dismissed from the Master Valsartan Complaints in the Court's prior rulings on Defendants' motions to dismiss regarding the Master Valsartan Complaints (*see* ECF 675-676, 728-729, 775-776, 818-819, 838-839, 1019-1020) and Plaintiffs' motion for leave to amend the Master Valsartan Complaints (*see* ECF 1614-1615, 1994) are dismissed with prejudice, each side to bear their own costs, for substantially the same reasons expressed in those rulings.
3. The parties' right to appeal the Court's rulings, orders and opinions as applied in this Stipulation to the Losartan and Irbesartan Master Complaints are preserved and are not waived, just as if they were set forth in orders and

opinions mirroring ECF 675-676, 728-729, 775-776, 818-819, 838-839, 1019-1020.

4. Defendants expressly preserve and do not waive their rights to challenge the remaining claims in the Master Valsartan, Losartan, and Irbesartan Complaints and any short form complaints, including through dispositive motions.
5. The parties expressly preserve and do not waive their existing rights to appeal the Court's prior rulings on Defendants' motions to dismiss regarding the Master Valsartan Complaints (*see* ECF 675-676, 728-729, 775-776, 818-819, 838-839, 1019-1020) and Plaintiffs' motion for leave to amend the Master Valsartan Complaints (*see* ECF 1614-1615, 1994). Nothing in this Stipulation is intended to expand, extinguish, or otherwise affect the parties' existing appellate rights as to those prior orders.

**SO ORDERED**, this 9th day of August, 2024.



**Renée Marie Bumb, Chief District Judge**

**STIPULATED TO BY:**

For Plaintiffs:

/s/ Ruben Honik

Ruben Honik  
**HONIK LLC**  
1515 Market Street, Suite 1100  
Philadelphia, PA 19102  
Phone: (267) 435-1300  
[ruben@honiklaw.com](mailto:ruben@honiklaw.com)

/s/ Conlee S. Whiteley

Conlee S. Whiteley  
**KANNER & WHITELEY, LLC**  
701 Camp Street  
New Orleans, LA 70130  
Phone: (504)-524-5777  
[c.whiteley@kanner-law.com](mailto:c.whiteley@kanner-law.com)

/s/ Adam Slater

Adam Slater  
**MAZIE, SLATER, KATZ &  
FREEMAN, LLC**  
103 Eisenhower Pkwy, 2nd Flr.  
Roseland, NJ 07068  
Phone: (973) 228-9898  
[aslater@mazieslater.com](mailto:aslater@mazieslater.com)

/s/ Daniel Nigh

Daniel Nigh  
**NIGH, GOLDENBERG, RASO &  
VAUGHN, PLLC**  
14 Ridge Square NW Third Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20016  
Phone: (850) 600-8090  
[dnigh@nighgoldenberg.com](mailto:dnigh@nighgoldenberg.com)

*MDL Plaintiffs' Co-Lead Counsel*

For Defendants:

/s/ Kara M. Kapke

Sarah E. Johnston

Kristen L. Richer

**BARNES & THORNBURG LLP**

2029 Century Park East, Suite 300

Los Angeles, CA 90067

Tel: (310) 284-3798

Fax: (310) 284-3894

[Sarah.Johnston@btlaw.com](mailto:Sarah.Johnston@btlaw.com)

[Kristen.Richer@btlaw.com](mailto:Kristen.Richer@btlaw.com)

Kara M. Kapke

**BARNES & THORNBURG LLP**

11 S Meridian St.

Indianapolis, IN 46204

Tel: (317) 236-1313

Fax (317) 231-7433

[kara.kapke@btlaw.com](mailto:kara.kapke@btlaw.com)

*Members of Defendants' Executive  
Committee, Liaison Counsel for  
Retailer Defendants and Attorneys for  
CVS Pharmacy, Inc.  
(incorrectly named as CVS Health  
Corporation), Rite Aid Corporation,  
Walgreen Co. (incorrectly named as  
Walgreens Co.), and Walmart Inc.  
(incorrectly named as Walmart Stores,  
Inc.)*

/s/ A. James Spung

Matthew D. Knepper

Sarah Zimmerman

**HUSCH BLACKWELL**

8001 Forsyth Blvd., Suite 1500

St. Louis, MO 63105

Tel: (314) 480-1500

Fax: (314) 480-1505

A. James Spung

**HUSCH BLACKWELL**

1801 Wewatta St., Suite 1000

Denver, CO 80202

Tel: (303) 749-7200

Fax: (303) 749-7272

*Attorneys for Cigna Corporation,  
Express Scripts Holding Company,  
Express Scripts, Inc.*

/s/ Victoria Davis Lockard

Lori G. Cohen  
Victoria Davis Lockard  
Steven M. Harkins  
**GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP**  
Terminus 200  
3333 Piedmont Rd., NE, Suite 2500  
Atlanta, GA 30305  
Tel: (678) 553-2385  
Fax: (678) 553-2386  
[cohenl@gtlaw.com](mailto:cohenl@gtlaw.com)  
[lockardv@gtlaw.com](mailto:lockardv@gtlaw.com)  
[harkinss@gtlaw.com](mailto:harkinss@gtlaw.com)

Gregory E. Ostfeld  
Tiffany M. Andras  
**GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP**  
77 West Wacker Drive, Suite 3100  
Chicago, Illinois 60601  
Tel: (312) 456-8400  
[ostfeldg@gtlaw.com](mailto:ostfeldg@gtlaw.com)  
[andrast@gtlaw.com](mailto:andrast@gtlaw.com)

*Members of Defendants' Executive  
Committee and Attorneys for Teva  
Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Teva  
Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd., Actavis  
LLC, and Actavis Pharma, Inc.*

/s/ Jessica Davidson

Jessica Davidson (NY Bar No. 6034748)  
**SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE,  
MEAGHER & FLOM LLP**  
One Manhattan West  
New York, NY 10001  
Tel: (212) 735-2588  
Fax: (917) 777-2588  
[jessica.davidson@skadden.com](mailto:jessica.davidson@skadden.com)  
*Liaison Counsel for Manufacturer  
Defendants*

Allison M. Brown  
(NJ Bar No. 044992012)  
One Manhattan West  
New York, NY 10001  
Tel: (212) 735-3222  
Fax: (917) 777-3222  
[allison.brown@skadden.com](mailto:allison.brown@skadden.com)

Nina R. Rose (DC Bar No. 975927)  
1440 New York Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 371-7000  
Fax: (202) 661-0525  
[nina.rose@skadden.com](mailto:nina.rose@skadden.com)

*Attorneys for Zhejiang Huahai  
Pharmaceutical Co., Ltd., Huahai U.S.,  
Inc., Princeton Pharmaceutical Inc., and  
Solco Healthcare U.S., LLC*

/s/ Jonathan D. Janow

Jonathan D. Janow  
Jason R. Parish  
**BUCHANAN INGERSOLL &  
ROONEY PC**  
1700 K Street NW, Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20006  
Tel: (202) 452-7940  
Fax: (202) 452-7989  
[jonathan.janow@bipc.com](mailto:jonathan.janow@bipc.com)  
[jason.parish@bipc.com](mailto:jason.parish@bipc.com)

*Attorneys for Albertson's LLC*

/s/ John P. Lavelle, Jr.

John P. Lavelle, Jr.  
**MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS  
LLP**  
502 Carnegie Center  
Princeton, NJ 08540  
Tel: (609) 919-6600  
[john.lavelle@morganlewis.com](mailto:john.lavelle@morganlewis.com)

*Attorney for Aurobindo Pharma, Ltd.,  
Aurobindo Pharma USA, Inc., and  
Aurolife Pharma, LLC*

/s/ Jeffrey D. Geoppinger

Jeffrey D. Geoppinger  
**UB GREENSFELDER LLP**  
312 Walnut Street, Suite 1400  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Tel: (513) 698-5038  
Fax: (513) 698-5039  
[jgeoppinger@ubglaw.com](mailto:jgeoppinger@ubglaw.com)

*Member of Defendants' Executive  
Committee, Liaison Counsel for  
Wholesaler Defendants, and Attorney  
for AmerisourceBergen Corporation  
(n/k/a Cencora, Inc.)*

/s/ Kirstin B. Ives

Kirstin B. Ives (IL ARDC 6289952)  
**FALKENBERG IVES LLP**  
230 W. Monroe Street, Suite 2220  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel: (312) 566-4803  
[kbi@falkenbergives.com](mailto:kbi@falkenbergives.com)

*Attorneys for Humana Pharmacy, Inc.*



/s/ John Eichlin

Douglas Tween

John Eichlin

**LINKLATERS LLP**

1290 Avenue of the Americas

New York, NY 10104

(212) 903-9000

[douglas.tween@linklaters.com](mailto:douglas.tween@linklaters.com)

[john.eichlin@linklaters.com](mailto:john.eichlin@linklaters.com)

*Attorneys for Vivimed Life Sciences Pvt.  
Ltd.*

/s/ Alexia R. Brancato

Alexia R. Brancato

Devora W. Allon

**KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**

601 Lexington Avenue

New York, New York 10022

Tel: (212) 446-5967

Fax: (212) 446-6460

[alexia.brancato@kirkland.com](mailto:alexia.brancato@kirkland.com)

[devora.allon@kirkland.com](mailto:devora.allon@kirkland.com)

*Attorneys for Defendants Torrent  
Pharmaceuticals Ltd. and Torrent  
Pharma, Inc.*

/s/ Roxanna V. Gonzalez

Michelle Grant (MN # 0311170)

Roxanna V. Gonzalez (#0397322)

**DORSEY & WHITNEY LLP**

50 South Sixth Street, Suite 1500

Minneapolis, MN 55402-1498

Tel: (612) 340-2600

Fax: (612) 340-2868

[grant.michelle@dorsey.com](mailto:grant.michelle@dorsey.com)

[gonzalez.roxanna@dorsey.com](mailto:gonzalez.roxanna@dorsey.com)

*Attorneys for OptumRx, Inc.; Optum,  
Inc.; and UnitedHealth Group  
Incorporated*

/s/ Vanessa V. Pisano

Geoffrey M. Coan

Vanessa V. Pisano

**HINSHAW & CULBERTSON, LLP**

53 State Street, 27th Floor

Boston, MA 02109

Tel: (617) 213-7000

Fax: (617) 213-7001

[gcoan@hinshawlaw.com](mailto:gcoan@hinshawlaw.com)

[vpisano@hinshawlaw.com](mailto:vpisano@hinshawlaw.com)

Mitchell S. Kurtz  
343 Thornall Street, Suite 640  
Edison, NJ 08837  
Tel: (908) 374-0341  
Fax: (908) 374-0345  
[mkurtz@hinshawlaw.com](mailto:mkurtz@hinshawlaw.com)

*Attorneys for Defendant  
ScieGen Pharmaceuticals Inc.*

/s/ Andrew F. Albero

Andrew F. Albero  
NJ Attorney ID #016542009  
**LEWIS BRISBOIS BISGAARD &  
SMITH LLP**  
550 E. Swedesford Road, Suite 270  
Wayne, PA 19087  
Tel: (215) 977-4058  
Fax: (215) 977-4101  
[andrew.albero@lewisbrisbois.com](mailto:andrew.albero@lewisbrisbois.com)

*Attorney for Camber Pharmaceuticals,  
Inc., and The Kroger Co.*

/s/ Andrew D. Kaplan

Andrew D. Kaplan  
Daniel T. Campbell  
Marie S. Dennis  
Emily G. Tucker  
**CROWELL & MORING**  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-1000  
Fax: (202) 628-5116  
[akaplan@crowell.com](mailto:akaplan@crowell.com)  
[dcampbell@crowell.com](mailto:dcampbell@crowell.com)  
[mdennis@crowell.com](mailto:mdennis@crowell.com)  
[etucker@crowell.com](mailto:etucker@crowell.com)

*Attorneys for Cardinal Health, Inc.*

/s/ Eric Abraham

Eric I. Abraham  
William P. Murtha  
**HILL WALLACK, LLP**  
21 Roszel Road  
Princeton, NJ 08543-5226  
Tel: (609) 734-6395  
[eabraham@hillwallack.com](mailto:eabraham@hillwallack.com)  
[wmurtha@hillwallack.com](mailto:wmurtha@hillwallack.com)

*Attorneys for Hetero Drugs Ltd. and  
Hetero Labs Ltd.*

/s/ D'Lesli M. Davis

D'Lesli M. Davis  
Ellie K. Norris  
**NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT US  
LLP**  
2200 Ross Avenue, Suite 3600  
Dallas, TX 75201-7932  
Tel: (214) 855-8221  
Fax: (214) 855-8200  
[dlesli.davis@nortonrosefulbright.com](mailto:dlesli.davis@nortonrosefulbright.com)  
[ellie.norris@nortonrosefulbright.com](mailto:ellie.norris@nortonrosefulbright.com)

*Attorneys for McKesson Corporation*

/s/ Neal Seth

Neal Seth (D.C. Bar No. 477011)

Corey Weinstein

**WILEY REIN LLP**

2050 M Street, NW

Washington, DC 20036

Tel: (202) 719-7000

Fax: (202) 719-7049

[nseth@wiley.law](mailto:nseth@wiley.law)

[cweinstein@wiley.law](mailto:cweinstein@wiley.law)

*Attorney for Macleods Pharma USA,  
Inc., and Macleods Pharmaceuticals  
Ltd.*